



2016

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

LEGAL ACTION REPORT AND SUMMARY OF MINUTES

Thursday, May 12, 2016
3rd Floor North Conference Room, Public Works Building,
201 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 12:00 PM, and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Arthur Stables, Jim Sauer, Sharon Chadwick, Helen Erickson, Patsy Waterfall.

Staff: Nicole Ewing-Gavin, Lynne Birkinbine, Frank Dillon, Michael Taku, Andrew Connor (PDSD), Alison Miller (Ward 6)

2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes for 4-28-16

Motion by Commissioner Waterfall, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 4-28-16.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 5-0 (*Commissioner Erickson arrived late)

3. Courtesy Review Cases

"Hacienda Motel" New Historic Landmark Signs (HLS): Treatment Plan, Restoration/Repair of Two (2) Pole Sign Cabinets, 1742 N Oracle - Presentation, Discussion and Feedback as a prelude to a formal review. No Action.

Staff Taku and Connor presented the review process necessary for this project. Staff indicated that the presentation is triggered by the need to meet the June 30th 2016 budget time line for neon signs, and applicant will return to PRS for detailed review and recommendation on 5/26/16.

The applicants, Jude Cook and Wendy Martin, will seek to designate two (2) freestanding nonconforming pole signs as a "Classic Historic Landmark Sign". Commissioners' discussion and feedback focused on neon colors.

4. **Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

a. **HPZ-16-16** – Cannon-Miller-Proposed New Single Family Residence—423 South 4th Avenue-(Armory Park) [Continued Case]

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) on 3/15/16 and 4/19/16. Staff noted PRS continued its review on 4/24/16 to allow the applicant time to provide additional information.

Presentation by project designer, Karen Merodias, and owner John Wesley Miller on the proposed construction of a single family residence and a detached garage.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall to recommend approval as submitted subject to (1) Garage door to be flat panel painted wood and; (2) If A-Mountain lava rock is not available for short wall around the entry porch, minor review for alternate material; and to adhere to APHZAB condition as follows:

a. All windows apertures must be wood double-hung or have the appearance of double-hung.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

b. **HPZ-16-24-** Liacus Development, Inc.-Demolition/Remodel/New Addition: Bedroom/Dining Room- 586 South Main Avenue, HO-3. (Barrio Historico)

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from Barrio Historico Historic Zone Advisory Board (BHHZAB) on 4/13/16.

Project architect Bob Lanning presented the background on the project. Architect Lanning focused on demolishing a small utility room to add a bedroom and dining room to the rear of the property.

Subcommittee requested the addition to be differentiated from the old according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards #9. It was suggested an offset or even stucco on the new addition.

It was moved by Commissioner Stables, duly seconded by Commissioner Waterfall to recommend approval as submitted subject to (1) New addition be differentiated by an offset; (2) Windows specified in the bedroom to be awning windows; (3) Demolition of non-historic utility room addition built in 1995 and; (4) Any significant changes to be subject to minor review.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- c. HPZ-16-27-** Global Community Communications Alliance-
Porch Extension/Railing/Fencing/Accessibility Ramp/Windows/Doors/
Stucco/New Paint [Zoning Violation]–630 North 4th Avenue-(West
University District)

Staff Taku read into the record, the recommendations from West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) on 4/19/16.

Project representative Catherine Lilly presented the background on the project and discussed how the violation will be abated. Ms. Lilly appealed to the subcommittee to consider allowing installation of wood windows on the front façade only. Subcommittee encouraged applicant to adhere to West University Design Guidelines on windows but remained willing to work with applicant on a replacement plan to minimize effect of cost.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables to recommend approval as submitted subject to (1) Return to PRS with details on how to address the concerns of West University on (1) windows and doors; (2) removal of tile installed over stucco at columns; and to adhere to all conditions of WUHZAB as follows:

- a. Porch Extension (new stone foundation and concrete slab) - Approved as resented
- b. Railing/Fencing - Approved as presented with condition of replacing fence top points with caps
- c. Accessibility Ramp - Approved as presented
- d. Windows and Doors - Not approved as material used does not conform to wood as noted in the current West University Neighborhood Guidelines
- e. Conversion of Existing Window into a Door at the South - Conversion approved, however, material used is not approved as it does not conform to the Guidelines noted above
- e. Stucco - Stucco approved, tile installed over stucco at columns is not approved
- f. Paint - Approved

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0. (* Commissioner Erickson joined)

5. H Rio Nuevo Area Review Cases

UDC Section 5.12.7

- a. H RNA-16-09** Diocese of Tucson- Parish Hall and Historic Wall Demolition – Revised Replacement Plan - 192 South Stone Avenue, (Downtown Core Sub district).

Staff Dillon summarized the process for MC and the changes to the proposal since the last PRS review.

The revised replacement plan was presented by Richard Fe Tom and Kegan Tom, architects, The Architecture Company. The Diocese of Tucson was represented by John Shaheen and Mitch Lorenz.

Subcommittee discussed and noted that the proposed revisions to the replacement plan were not sufficient to sway its recommendation from the previous review.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Stables to recommend denial of the replacement plan concept for two reasons: (1) incompatibility with the historic context, in particular: "massing," "height," "projections and recessions," and "details," and (2) the treatment of the historic wall as discussed. The applicant was referred to the approved conceptual proposal by Poster Frost Mirto for renovating the Marist College Building where the entire wall fronting that property was retained with minimal changes. And, in the event that Mayor and Council after public hearing decide to approve the demolition of the Parish Hall, recommended that any future work on this site be subject to review by the PRS.

Further notes as follows: PRS appreciates the attempts by the applicants to address some of the subcommittee's previously expressed concerns on "massing," "height," "projections and recessions," and "details," but we find that the proposed changes are not sufficient for a recommendation for approval.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 6-0.

6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

- a.** Minor Reviews

Staff Taku will conduct reviews with Commissioner Chadwick.

b. Appeals

None at this time

c. Zoning Violations

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations in the City Historic Districts and Rio Nuevo Area.

d. Review Process for Approval of Complex Large-Scale and/or Multi-Phase Projects

e. (*) Proposed Alternative Shrub for TCC Olive Balcony Planting [Historic Landscape Subcommittee-Recommendation for adoption]

Commissioner Chadwick motioned, seconded by Commissioner Waterfall to adopt the recommendation of the HLS on 4/27/16 and to commend Commissioner Erickson and the HLS.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0 (*Commissioner Sauer recused).

f. (*) Relocation of TCC Kiosk Lights [Historic Landscape Subcommittee-Recommendation for adoption]

Commissioner Chadwick motioned, seconded by Commissioner Waterfall to adopt the recommendation of the HLS on 4/27/16 and to commend Commissioner Erickson and the HLS.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0 (*Commissioner Sauer recused).

Note-Commissioner Erickson, Chair of HLS updated PRS member on the two recommendations.

7. Call to the Audience (For Information Only)

A word of appreciation from the Subcommittee to staff Dillon as he leaves the City of Tucson for a new career with the City of Nogales.

8. Future Agenda Items

Trinity Presbyterian Church Preservation Boundary and Mixed Use Development. Single Family Residences (West University and Armory Park)

9. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:12 PM.